TPCB Student Town Hall
January 9, 2023

chembio.triiprograms.org

TPCB Student Town Hall – January 2023

Agenda

A. Introduction – Derek Tan

B. Student Support Resources Review – Derek Tan

C. TPCB Progress Report – Derek Tan

D. TPCB International Students Group – Chloe Burnside

E. Tri-I Outreach Programs – Alexa Strauss

F. Open Discussion
A. Introduction
TPCB is unique

TPCB Mission
Train the next generation of scientific leaders working at the interface of chemistry, biology, and medicine

TPCB students play a central role in shaping and improving both the program and the broader scientific community

Student input and contributions are vital to our continued progress within TPCB

We can directly impact what we do in TPCB and also advocate for institutional policies

Student Support  Scientific Excellence

A. Introduction
A partial list of our recent progress in supporting TPCB students

Dec 1, 2012  Tan appointed TPCB Director, with initial focus on curriculum & recruitment

Jun 9, 2017  TPCB Individual Development Plan (IDP) customized form launched
May 5, 2018  MSK Industrial Recruiting Program expanded to all TPCB labs
Apr 30, 2019  TPCB website upgraded with ADA Accessibility tools

Jan 16, 2020  TPCB Town Hall raises issue of student mental health support
Jan 1, 2020  COVID-19 first confirmed case in NYC
Mar 6, 2020  TPCB COVID-19 Updates emails initiated (13 updates thru Feb 7, 2022)
Mar 17, 2020  TPCB Remote Programming Task Force launched
Apr 15, 2020  TPCB semiannual student check-ins initiated
May 6, 2020  TPCB Mental Health & Wellness Resources summary published
May 25, 2020  Murder of George Floyd

Jun 12, 2020  TPCB Call to Action issued by TPCB students & alumni
Jun 18, 2020  TPCB Diversity, Inclusion & Outreach Programs summary published
Jun 29, 2020  TPCB Town Hall discusses Call to Action with leadership & institutional staff

Oct 1, 2020  TPCB Diversity & Inclusion webpage launched
Oct 19, 2020  TPCB Diversity & Inclusion Climate Survey launched
Nov 16, 2020  TPCB Student Town Hall reviews Call to Action progress and Climate Survey
Jul 1, 2021  TPCB Peer Mentoring Program launched
Nov 9, 2021  TPCB Childcare & Parenting Resources summary published
Nov 22, 2021  TPCB Student Town Hall reviews progress to date and additional student input
Feb 1, 2022  TPCB Career Development Resources summaries consolidated

Feb 15, 2022  TPCB Science Outreach webpage launched (including TORC, TIMI)
Aug 11, 2022  TPCB International Students Group launched
Aug 19, 2022  TPCB Graduate Requirement “rubrics” published (later adopted by WCGS)
Dec 15, 2022  TPCB Seminar Course integrates “hidden curriculum” training

Jan 9, 2023  TPCB Student Town Hall reviews recent progress and solicits student input
2023  TPCB Student Service Award to be launched
B. Student Support Resources

Mental health & wellness services and programs are available to all students

TPCB Intranet
https://chembio.triiprograms.org/about-tpcb/intranet/#studentsupport

Judith Cukor, PhD
Assistant Dean, Student Affairs
Weill Cornell Graduate School

Patricia Marino, PhD
Director, Student Mental Health
Weill Cornell Graduate School

Jessica Spellun, MD
Onsite Psychiatrist
Rockefeller University

Chanchal Sharma, PsyD
Assistant Attending Psychologist
MSK Employee Health & Wellness

B. Student Support Resources

Career development training is provided by both TPCB and the three institutions

TPCB Intranet
https://chembio.triiprograms.org/about-tpcb/intranet/#career

Aubrey DeCarlo, PhD
Manager, Career & Professional Development, WCGS

TPCB
• Individual Devt Plans
• TPCB Career Devt Retreat
• Teaching & mentoring opps
• Industrial recruitment
• Alumni networking

Career & Prof Devt Offices
• Individual consultations
• Fellowship workshops
• Prof devt workshops
• Tri-I Career Fair
• Company site visits

Thalyana Stathis, PhD
Manager, Career & Professional Development, MSK

Andrea Morriss, PhD
Assistant Dean and Director, Career & Professional Devt, RU
B. Student Support Resources

Specific support is available for international students and for students who are parents.

TPCB Intranet
https://chembio.triprograms.org/about-tpcb/intranet/#studentsupport

Herminio Quinones
Assistant Director
Finance & Grants, WCCGS

Clive Liew
Administrator, International Student Services, WCM

International Student Support

- Visa and I-20 applications
- Onboarding during Orientation
- TPCB advocating for additional support
- New WCGS webpage planned for 2023
- TPCB International Students Group (2022)

B. Student Support Resources

The three institutions support programs to promote diversity, inclusion, and outreach

TPCB Intranet
https://chembio.triprograms.org/about-tpcb/intranet/#diversity

Yasmin Carrasco, PhD
Assistant Dean, Diversity & Student Life
Weill Cornell Graduate School

Roxana Mesias, PhD
Diversity Program Manager
Weill Cornell Graduate School

Vaihara Fortis-Santiago, PhD
Associate Director, Postdoc Affairs & Trainee Diversity Initiatives, MSK

Jeanne Garbarino, PhD
Director, Science Outreach
Rockefeller University

includes Ombudsperson and Title IX
C. TPCB Progress Report

TPCB Progress Report

TPCB has a long track record of promoting diversity, enhanced by student Call to Action

TPCB Diversity & Inclusion

https://chembio.triiprograms.org/about-tpcb/diversity-inclusion/

TPCB Student Diversity (last 10 years)

- 22% URM students (16% national average)
- 20% URM graduates (12% national average)
- 10% Disadvantaged (NIH policy change 2019)
- 12% with self-identified disabilities (6.7% natl avg)
- 33% International students (6 continents)

TPCB Call to Action – June 12, 2020

- 10 concrete, actionable proposals
- Efforts already in place but not visible enough:
  - public statements on racism & mental health, URM recruitment, fee waivers, speakers ≥50% women, faculty training (mentorship, diversity, inclusion)
- New efforts launched:
  - webpage, resource docs (mental health, diversity, childcare, career dev), RCR module pilot, speakers ≥20% URM, TPCB Orientation meetings, TPCB Orientation Committee, TPCB Peer Mentoring, HSI recruiting, ChBSP URM slots, Open House (preferred pronouns, diversity session, international mixer), TPCB Outreach, TPCB Retreat discussions, TPCB Climate Surveys, TPCB Town Halls

C. TPCB Progress Report

All issues raised at the Nov 2021 TPCB Town Hall have been addressed

Recruitment and Outreach

- Add HSI Community Colleges to ChBSP recruitment channels – √ 12/7/21
- Add Tribal Colleges & Universities to TPCB & ChBSP recruitment channels – √ 9/1/22
- Highlight Outreach Programs on TPCB website – √ 2/15/22 (Kotliar, Stella, Strauss)

International Students

- Establish TPCB International Students Group – √ 8/11/22 (Burnside)
- Include Clive Liew in recruitment events – √ 1/4/22

Student Onboarding and Progression to Degree

- Refine TPCB Peer Mentoring Program for next class – √ 7/1/22 (V. Jordan)
- Address “hidden curriculum” in academia – √ 5/20/22 (Prescott & Ray; Seminar Course)
- Clarify rubrics for graduation – √ 8/19/22 (later adopted by WCGS)
- Semiannual check-ins with all students – √ 5/2/22 & 9/28/22

Social Events

- Highlight Social Committee events and members on TPCB website – √ 2/2/22
- Resume TPCB Holiday Party – Jan 2022 canceled due to Omicron, NEXT 1/12/23
- Resume TPCB Student Retreat – √ 5/4/22 (Cahir & Rasmussen)
C. TPCB Progress Report

All issues raised at the Nov 2021 TPCB Town Hall have been addressed

About TPCB
https://chembio.triiprograms.org/about-tpcb/

Student Service
- Concerns expressed about recognition of student service
  - All service is voluntary and we encourage that it be listed on CVs
  - Service continues to be recognized publicly on website, LinkedIn, etc.
  - Seminar Course & RIP Course Assistants have been paid positions since 2020-21
  - Social Committee members now listed on Student Life webpage (1/27/22)
  - TPCB Student Service Award will be launched in 2023!

Career Development
- Concerns expressed about faculty attention to student career development
  - Faculty reminded of responsibility to support career development broadly (11/22/22)
  - Faculty voted to require discussion of IDP at thesis committee meetings (11/22/22)

Faculty Mentorship and Engagement
- Request to meet with committee without mentor before Candidacy Exam
  - This is not consistent with graduate school policy; PI is a standing member of exam committee
  - Candidacy Exam has a distinct academic purpose vs Thesis Committee meetings
  - Students raised concerns about PI should discuss with Director & Committee at any time

- Questions raised about mentor training for faculty
  - Formal mentor training has been required for TPCB faculty since 2019
  - Rackham mentorship & menteeship guides provided on the TPCB Intranet since 2019
  - Faculty reminded to participate in mentor continuing education annually (11/22/22)

- Desire expressed for more in-person interactions with faculty
  - Faculty reminded of importance of attending meetings & events in person (11/22/22)
  - TPCB RIP will resume 100% in person in 2023, with many guest faculty attending
Climate Survey Overview

- Survey based on MSK HR survey circulated institution-wide in 2020
- Customized for TPCB in consultation with diversity program staff & students
- Specifically focused on inclusion, of all types, at the TPCB program level
- We do not address equity explicitly, but its importance is recognized in questions regarding support for students
- Survey opened Oct 14, 2022, closed Oct 26, 2022
- 35 out of 52 students completed survey (67%)
- Survey results shared in full with faculty

Takehome Messages

- Most respondents view TPCB diversity & inclusion increasingly positively
- However, importantly, several view TPCB diversity & inclusion negatively
- TPCB has and continues to work to address the specific comments raised
- Need everyone to contribute to this effort (14 committed to own actions (40%))
- PLEASE bring your concerns to Derek directly or indirectly so we can help!

C. TPCB Progress Report

Climate Survey: Key definitions

DIVERSITY is defined as the traits and characteristics that make people unique.

INCLUSION is defined as the behaviors and social norms that ensure people feel welcome.

SOCIAL IDENTITY is defined as a person’s sense of who they are based on their group membership(s), e.g., racial or ethnic background, nationality or citizenship, religion, gender identity or expression, sexual orientation, age, disability status, marital or parental status, socioeconomic status or background.
C. TPCB Progress Report

Climate Survey: Assessments of current TPCB culture

**Current TPCB Culture**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Current TPCB culture embraces:</th>
<th>2022</th>
<th>2021</th>
<th>2020</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Diverse student body</td>
<td>4.40</td>
<td>4.31</td>
<td>4.50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Inclusive environment</td>
<td>4.54</td>
<td>4.40</td>
<td>4.29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Supportive environment</td>
<td>4.51</td>
<td>4.31</td>
<td>4.29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Equal opportunity to succeed</td>
<td>4.40</td>
<td>4.17</td>
<td>4.24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Two-way communication</td>
<td>4.60</td>
<td>4.17</td>
<td>4.47</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Aggregated Comments:**
1) Our student body is getting more diverse.
4) Some differences in what people know coming into the program are not always addressed in classes.
5) Changes have been implemented in recent years with continued dialogue to improve DEI in TPCB.

C. TPCB Progress Report

Climate Survey: TPCB responsiveness and commitment

**Current TPCB Culture**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>TPCB program / respondents:</th>
<th>2022</th>
<th>2021</th>
<th>2020</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Responds to incidents</td>
<td>4.37</td>
<td>4.23</td>
<td>4.56</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Visible D&amp;I commitment</td>
<td>4.66</td>
<td>4.43</td>
<td>4.53</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Aware of D&amp;I resources</td>
<td>4.54</td>
<td>4.29</td>
<td>4.30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Aware of disability services</td>
<td>4.20</td>
<td>3.97</td>
<td>4.26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Know where to report</td>
<td>4.14</td>
<td>3.74</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Aggregated Comments:**
2) Commitment to female seminar speakers good; increase URM speakers by inviting less-senior faculty.
5) If anything happened in my lab, I would report to PI directly; should I share info with TPCB leadership?
C. TPCB Progress Report

*Climate Survey: Fair treatment in the TPCB program*

### Fair Treatment

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Category</th>
<th>2022</th>
<th>2021</th>
<th>2020</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>n = 35</td>
<td>n = 35</td>
<td>n = 34</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Race or ethnicity</td>
<td>4.80</td>
<td>4.66</td>
<td>4.56</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nationality or citizenship</td>
<td>4.60</td>
<td>4.49</td>
<td>4.35</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Religion</td>
<td>4.71</td>
<td>4.63</td>
<td>4.62</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sex, gender ID / expression</td>
<td>4.66</td>
<td>4.51</td>
<td>4.65</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sexual orientation</td>
<td>4.80</td>
<td>4.71</td>
<td>4.74</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Aggregated Comments:**

1) Some people unduly put-upon to showcase TPCB diversity at events without compensation.

### Fair Treatment

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Category</th>
<th>2022</th>
<th>2021</th>
<th>2020</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>n = 35</td>
<td>n = 35</td>
<td>n = 34</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Age</td>
<td>4.80</td>
<td>4.69</td>
<td>4.74</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Disability status</td>
<td>4.40</td>
<td>4.57</td>
<td>4.65</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Marital or parental status</td>
<td>4.40</td>
<td>4.43</td>
<td>4.47</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Socioeconomic status / bkgd</td>
<td>4.69</td>
<td>4.49</td>
<td>4.53</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Aggregated Comments:**

3) Housing remains an issue for married students and those with children.
C. TPCB Progress Report

Climate Survey: Value as an individual within the TPCB community

Value as an Individual

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>2022</th>
<th>2021</th>
<th>2020</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>TPCB leadership</td>
<td>4.49</td>
<td>4.54</td>
<td>4.47</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other TPCB students</td>
<td>4.71</td>
<td>4.51</td>
<td>4.44</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>My research group</td>
<td>4.46</td>
<td>4.37</td>
<td>4.47</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>My PI(s)</td>
<td>4.20</td>
<td>4.20</td>
<td>4.35</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Aggregated Comments:
1) I feel there is favoritism to certain students.

C. TPCB Progress Report

Climate Survey: Social identity and Disability status

Social Identity

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>2022</th>
<th>2021</th>
<th>2020</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Keep social identity separate</td>
<td>3.71</td>
<td>3.69</td>
<td>3.91</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hesitate to provide feedback</td>
<td>1.63</td>
<td>1.66</td>
<td>1.71</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>People assume I am less skilled</td>
<td>1.74</td>
<td>1.83</td>
<td>1.76</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>People treat me negatively</td>
<td>1.51</td>
<td>1.54</td>
<td>1.44</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Performance used to judge others</td>
<td>2.34</td>
<td>1.91</td>
<td>1.97</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Uncomfortable discussing disability</td>
<td>2.50</td>
<td>2.20</td>
<td>1.00</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Aggregated Comments:
1) Nothing intrinsically wrong with keeping parts of one’s personal life separate from professional life; I don’t feel need to keep things separate for fear of fitting in.
6) [Disability status comment omitted for privacy reasons].
C. TPCB Progress Report

Climate Survey: Student experiences

Are there any experiences you would like to share regarding diversity and inclusion in TPCB?

Aggregated Comments:
- There are open and honest conversations about D&I starting from the application & interview process.
- I appreciate TPCB's commitment to TIMS and to providing fee waivers for those who could benefit the most; these and other outreach programs are critical to the future of the program.
- I enjoy interacting with the diverse individuals in TPCB, though there is less geographic diversity.
- Thank you for taking the suggestion from last year to start the TPCB International Student Group!
- I felt isolated over the last year because it was difficult to see people in person, but that is improving.

C. TPCB Progress Report

Climate Survey: Recommended changes in TPCB

What should TPCB consider changing (doing less of, more of, or differently) in support of diversity and inclusion?

Aggregated Comments:
- Would be nice to have more opportunities for socialization; difficulty to feel welcome if you don’t know people well or only by Zoom.
- Host a dedicated TPCB event each year for those who are graduating to foster increased community.
- Wish for more cross-cultural interactions between students, such as a multicultural event or outing.
- More affinity groups for students from outgroups.
- Advertise the D&I resources and clubs more.
- Recruitment initiatives to visit minority-serving institutions will support D&I in TPCB.
- TPCB students lead and participate in outreach programs for the community, perhaps we can host an internal event for TPCB students to share information and increase engagement further.
- Continue calling out incidents of racism & sexism; encourage students to foster inclusive environment.
- PIs should support PhD trainee career development, including applying for fellowships, presenting at conferences, learning new techniques, taking an additional class, going to career fairs, even if it means shifting some focus away from the lab to support these other aspects of our training.
- Selection process for the SOC is exclusive; this comes up every year and nothing has changed.
- TPCB is really diverse as it is.
- I feel comfortable in TPCB and am content with the program’s support of D&I.
C. TPCB Progress Report

Climate Survey: Actions you will take

What actions will you take to help make TPCB a more inclusive program that values differences?

Aggregated Comments:

- Work with disadvantaged communities through HS and undergrad mentorship programs at WCM and RU.
- Continue to participate in outreach & recruitment efforts; support and engage with current students.
- Participate in STEM recruitment initiatives to encourage students to apply to TPCB.
- Work on science outreach initiatives; ensure that new students feel welcome and supported in my lab.
- Participate in outreach programs; pass my knowledge onto the next generation; I alone can’t instill systemic change required for true D&I, but I can help correct for existing inequalities and lack of resources.
- Foster inclusive mentorship for students from underrepresented backgrounds thru our outreach programs.
- Serving as a peer mentor; working with Diversity Office to ensure that TPCB students included in programs.
- Advocate for TPCB and lab events that are inclusive (i.e.: timing, food/drink options); have conversations with others about the importance of DEI in science; hear alternative views; brainstorm ways to improve.
- Help others without discrimination; ensure inclusion in all social events.
- Reach out to more first-years to assist with the challenging transition to graduate school.
- Ensure that everyone feels welcome, safe, and equal; be open to talking to those from different bkgds.
- Make new TPCB students feel welcome and encourage other older students to do so; helping create an inclusive, warm, supportive community from the start will set the tone for the program.
- Treat everyone with respect; do my best to be a positive representative of TPCB, especially in outreach.
- Seek out new people in TPCB and learn what makes them awesome; help them if they need it.

D. TPCB International Students Group

Launched in 2022, open to all TPCB students

Chloe Burnside (chair), Chen Chen, Yingying Hu, Nicolai Tornow, Emily Wu, Yang Xiao

- Formed in Aug 2022 following a request in the annual TPCB Climate Survey
- Goal: to better celebrate, support and welcome international students within the TPCB community
- Working with Clive Liew to facilitate onboarding of international students, particularly those arriving from overseas (e.g., visas, vaccinations, social security numbers, bank accounts, reimbursements, taxes)
- Launched #international-student Slack channel to facilitate communication about issues faced by the international student community
- Events so far: International Student Potluck – Oct 20, 2022
- More events coming soon!
E. Tri-I Outreach Programs

TPCB aims to promote a culture of outreach throughout the program and community.

Tri-Institutional Outreach Committee
A Partnership of

Weill Cornell ~ Sloan Kettering ~ Rockefeller

Who we are:

• Graduate students from across the Tri-I community with a shared passion for science outreach have come together to form TOrc
• Contact: tri.i.outreach.committee@gmail.com

Mission:

• Our mission is to offer mentorship, provide resources, and spread awareness about careers in STEM
• Increase accessibility for students who lack resources in their local communities
• Connect members of the Tri-I with a common passion for outreach and mentorship
E. Tri-I Outreach Programs
TORC Student Leadership

Our Initiatives – Tri-I Mentorship Initiative (TIMI)

BY THE NUMBERS

- 79 mentor-mentee matches
- 15 countries
- 65 schools

Superb growth

- 19% increase in 2022

Testimonials from TIMI Mentees

“TIMI helped me understand the process of applying to PhD programs. I felt very lost and overwhelmed at the start of the program, but by the end, I gained a close peer mentor who recently went through the grad application process and was very invested in me.”

“Being selected as a participant of the TIMI 2022 program was one of the best experiences I had in 2022! I found the program extremely helpful and timely. Before meeting with my mentor, I wasn’t convinced about my qualifications and preparedness for graduate school applications. Being an international student, I had doubts about being a good fit for graduate school in the USA. But my mentor’s commitment to encouraging me, guiding me in preparing my documents, sharing her experiences, her availability and selflessness helped build my confidence in my qualifications and skills. Working with her made my application submissions possible. I am very grateful to the TIMI Organizers for their selfless service.”

Tri-Institutional Mentorship Initiative (TIMI)

SUMMER - FALL 2022

ELIGIBILITY

The program is open to undergraduate or graduate students pursuing a degree in biomedical science, engineering, or related fields.

APPLY TO BE A TIMI MENTEE

If you are interested in applying, please submit your application by August 30. Mentors will be notified of their acceptance by September 1.

VIRTUAL PROGRAMMING

Free virtual programming including webinars, workshops, and panel discussions on topics such as graduate school preparation, career development, and research.

ON-ONE MEETINGS

Mentorship meetings will be scheduled throughout the program, ensuring regular check-ins and providing opportunities to discuss personal and professional development.

INAGURAL YEAR: 2020

- 4 customized events for TIMI participants
- 215% increase in graduation rates
- 65 schools

Alexa Strauss
4th year TPCB

Ilana Kotliar
5th year TPCB

Gianna Stella
4th year TPCB

Ifé Akano
4th year Pharmacology

Leandro Pimentel Marcelino
1st year TPCB

Brittney Bobowski
2nd year Pharmacology

Anthony Villegas
1st year Neuroscience

Jaina Wollowitz
1st year TPCB

Ian McBain
1st year IMP
E. Tri-I Outreach Programs

Our Initiatives – Tri-I Outreach Fair

Tri-Institutional Outreach Fair 2022

A showcase of outreach opportunities in the Tri-I and the greater NYC area

February 15th, 3:30 - 5:00 PM
Zoom Meeting
Open to members of the Tri-I

Schedule:
- Short presentations on each initiative: 3:30 - 4:30 PM
- Interactive session to talk to representatives: 4:30 - 5:00 PM

BY THE NUMBERS:
Inaugural Year - 2022

- 13 organizations participated
- Four professional groups
- Eight trainee-run groups

- 70% learned about a new opportunity
- 30% signed up for a volunteer opportunity

Over 65 participants attended

Testimonials:
- "It was amazing to hear generally about the opportunities beyond my institution in the Tri-I community and NYC, so I could look into each of them more and decide in what ways I wanted to engage."  
- "Consolidating all of these groups into one event was helpful to get a grasp of all of the opportunities available."

Looking forward to 2023...
Stay tuned for an in person event in Late February!

E. Tri-I Outreach Programs

Thank you! Questions?

tri.i.outreach.committee@gmail.com

Tri-Institutional Outreach Committee

A Partnership of

Weill Cornell ~ Sloan Kettering ~ Rockefeller
F. Open Discussion

What did we miss? Where do we go from here?